



Melanie Klein Trust

Klein in Scotland I & II

By Dr John Shemilt, Member, British Psychoanalytic Society and Scottish Association of Psychoanalytic Psychotherapists

Presented at:

Before and Beyond Words: Exploring Melanie Klein's Work and Influence

Organised by the Royal College of Psychiatrists in Scotland Medical Psychotherapy Faculty in conjunction with the Melanie Klein Trust, 24-25 November 2017, Pitlochry Festival Theatre

Klein in Scotland I

Today and tomorrow I am going to give some personal reflections on the place of Melanie Klein's work in Pitlochry, where it fits in the evolution of her clinical thinking, and some of the possibly less well known ways in which Klein, Scotland and Scottish psychoanalysis are interwoven.

30 years ago in 1987 Hanna Segal came to Pitlochry. On Saturday 2nd of May we gathered for a ceremony at the Girl Guide Hut on Well Brae, one of the lanes that ascend to the north east of the town. Hanna Segal, representing the Melanie Klein Trust and the British Psychoanalytical Society, unveiled a plaque commemorating Melanie Klein's use of the Girl Guide Hut as a playroom. This is where she analysed her ten-year-old patient "Richard" during the war years 1940 and 1941, described session by session in the *Narrative of a Child Analysis* (Klein, 1961).

From the 1970's until the early 2000's the Pitlochry residential conference met twice a year, in spring and autumn organised by the Scottish Psychotherapy



Section of the Royal College. People came from a wide range of psychiatric, psychotherapy and psychoanalytic work, in both child and adult settings. Two rituals of conference attendance over the years were a short walk up to the Guide Hut, and also to the salmon ladder on the River Tummel where we might also see salmon fishing going on in the river. Klein's patient "Richard" met her near her lodgings before his 52nd session delighted to present her with a piece of the salmon that his Daddy had caught in the river; and HMS Salmon appears in several of Richard's drawings.

Klein came to Pitlochry in 1940, but was also anxious to get back to London. In July 1940 she wrote to Donald Winnicott, "Scotland surpasses my expectations - that is saying a lot since from a very early time in my life I fancied it as beautiful and romantic," and went on to say that she had found "very good accommodation with nice people in a simple but pleasant house in the most lovely position." (Grosskurth, 1986 p. 254) Yet by the late summer of 1941 she was back in London.

Melanie was born in Vienna in 1882. She was an academically able child and planned to study medicine but instead married Arthur Klein at the age of 21. They had three children, Melitta, Hans and Erich, the youngest, born in 1914. In 1987 Eric Clyne (Erich), who lived in Potters Bar in London, came to Pitlochry for the unveiling ceremony.

The Kleins had moved to Budapest in 1910 and Melanie went into analysis there with Sandor Ferenczi, the leading psychoanalyst in the Hungarian Society. Ferenczi then encouraged Melanie Klein to work with children. Melanie's marriage to Arthur Klein did not last. They separated in 1919. In 1921 Klein moved to Berlin carrying on her work with children, now supported to do so by Karl Abraham, founding father of the Berlin Psychoanalytical Society. Klein became a member of the Berlin Society, and in 1924 also



began a second analysis with Abraham. This analysis ended with Abraham's death in December of 1925. (Grosskurth, 1986, p. 463-464).

A number of British psychoanalytic pioneers also went to Berlin for analysis and to learn about psychoanalysis in these days before formal training requirements as we know them now. This British group of analysts would be instrumental in bringing Klein to London. After Abraham's death Klein had lost not only her analyst, but also her principal advocate in Berlin against those who regarded her work as deviation from orthodox Freudian psychoanalysis. They could not accept, from the perspective of their work with adults, what they regarded as the horrific and unrealistic nature of Klein's reports of her young patient's phantasies (Lindon, 1966). Whilst in Berlin Melanie Klein and Alix Strachey became good friends, going dancing and to the opera together. James Strachey, who was in London, and Alix wrote a steady flow of letters (Messed & Kendrick, 1986), in which they discussed Klein and her work. There was already lively discussion of child analysis going on in the British Society in London (Sayers, 1991, p. 223). Mary Chadwick and Nina Searl on their return from Berlin in the earlier 1920's had begun to work with children. Sylvia Payne and Ella Sharpe had also been in Berlin. The Scottish brothers, from Glasgow, James and Edward Glover had both been in analysis with Abraham like Klein, and were amongst Ernest Jones' closest colleagues. They were all interested in Klein's work with children, and encouraged Ernest Jones as President to invite Klein to lecture in London, which she did in 1925. Recognising the support for her work in the British Society, Klein moved permanently to London in 1926.

In one of her most creative periods, Klein published the paper 'The Importance of Symbol-Formation in the Development of the Ego' in 1930 and the book *The Psycho-Analysis of Children* in 1932 (Klein, 1930; 1932). After the death of his brother James in 1926, Edward Glover was now Ernest Jones' number two in running the British Society, and although mainly



remembered for later turning against Klein, at this time he enthusiastically supported Klein. He gave Klein's book a glowing review. He wrote, "I have no hesitation in stating that...her book is of fundamental importance for the future of psychoanalysis." (Glover, 1933)

Differences between Klein's approach to child analysis and that of Anna Freud and the Viennese analysts were increasingly apparent. Klein described an earlier functional superego in young children, and substituting play for free association, approached the transference essentially as in adult psychoanalysis. The situation came to a head when the Freuds and other Viennese psychoanalysts took refuge in London in the later 1930's, and were joined by Klein's daughter Melitta and Edward Glover in criticising Klein's approach as an attack on Freudian orthodoxy.

Klein's first analyst, Ferenczi had died of pernicious anaemia in 1933. It was Ferenczi who had introduced the concept of introjection in 1909 (Ferenczi, 1909 [1952]; 1912 [1955]). Both Klein, and here in Scotland, Ronald Fairbairn (Fairbairn, 1944 [1952 p.82]), recognised that Freud had described an introjected object relationship formed by identification with parental objects when he distinguished the superego from other functional features of the ego and the id in 1923 (Freud, 1923).

Before his death Karl Abraham had described part-object relations in his theory of oral and anal phases of libidinal development, along with corresponding attitudes of incorporation and expulsion (Abraham, 1924 [1927]), but Abraham's work came before Klein had drawn attention to the central role of internalised object relations in infant development (Fairbairn, 1946 [1952 p.143]). Drawing on Freud's 'Mourning and Melancholia', (Freud, 1917 [1915]), and her own clinical observations, Klein introduced the concept of the depressive position in her 1935 paper 'A Contribution to the Psychogenesis of Manic-Depressive States' (Klein, 1935). She expanded on



this in her 1940 paper 'Mourning and its Relation to Manic-Depressive States' (Klein, 1940). Klein's revolutionary thinking about early development and the analysis of young children contained the idea that processes of introjection and projection start at the very beginning of life, as soon as there is differentiation between self and object sufficient for an inner world to begin to form. As Donald Meltzer (Meltzer, 1978) points out in his book on the analysis of "Richard", in many ways Klein's greatest contribution to psychoanalysis is her very concrete conception of this inner world. Klein wrote in the 1940 paper (Klein, 1940), "The baby having incorporated his parents, feels them to be live people inside his body in the concrete way in which deep unconscious phantasies are experienced - they are, in his mind, 'internal' or 'inner' objects, as I have termed them."

In my very cursory description of the development of Klein's clinical and theoretical work up until 1940 when Klein came to Pitlochry and analysed "Richard", I am emphasising the creation of an inner world of unconscious phantasy in which objects and object relationships are experienced concretely and expressed accordingly in a child's play and communications in analysis. Klein at this time viewed the depressive position as central in development. It was not until 1946, after her work with "Richard" in Pitlochry was finished, but before she wrote up the *Narrative*, that Klein recognised the significance of Fairbairn's work on the schizoid position, which she renamed the paranoid-schizoid position as a result (Klein, 1946). And it was with this, after her work in Pitlochry, that Klein fully recognised that it is not only an object but also the self that is split into good and bad.

In the years following the publication of the 1935 paper (Klein, 1935) there was a dreadful deterioration in Klein's relationship with both Edward Glover, and her daughter, Melitta Schmideberg who was in analysis with Glover. The depressive position and the elaboration of early childhood development and phantasy were now mercilessly attacked as deviation from orthodox



psychoanalysis. Glover compared Klein with Jung, and effectively accused Klein of re-working the notion of original sin in her depiction of innate aggression and an internalised bad object (Glover, 1948 [1956]). At the same time the Freuds and many of their Viennese colleagues who also opposed Klein's work had arrived in London.

Thus, when she came to Pitlochry in July 1940, Klein's position in the British Society and the place of her work in mainstream psychoanalysis was in the balance. War conditions in London made psychoanalytic practice very difficult so an invitation to take on psychoanalytic work in Pitlochry was nevertheless attractive. The refugee psychoanalysts who were classed by the Home Office as aliens were not free to leave London, but Klein had British citizenship since 1934 and so was able to travel (English Heritage, 2017).

On arrival in Pitlochry, Klein rented rooms at Ashbank House at 14 Tomcroy Road, which is still a boarding house today. Klein started out with two patients for analysis, "Dick" and Dick's brother. "Dick" had been in analysis with Klein in London. He was the four-year-old patient in Klein's 1930 paper 'Symbol-Formation in Ego Development' (Klein, 1930). When war broke out "Dick", now a teenager, and his family moved to Pitlochry and then persuaded Klein to follow.

Phyllis Grosskurth in her biography of Klein adds a footnote that "Dick" and Dick's brother, and "Richard" were cousins (Grosskurth, 1986 p.266). Richard's mother had originally written to psychoanalyst Dr. David Matthew in London six years earlier when Richard was four years old concerned about Richard's anxiety. "Richard" deteriorated rather than improved. Dr. Matthew referred him to Mrs. Klein in Pitlochry because "Richard" was afraid of other children, terrified of going outdoors, depressed and hypochondriacal, and unable to attend school despite being otherwise an intellectually and musically gifted and loving child.



Klein met other patients in a room in the Ashbank boarding house. These included Dr. Matthew himself, and a general practitioner, Dr. Jack Fieldman, referred by Sylvia Payne in London. Ashbank House was not suitable for young children, so Klein negotiated the use of the Girl Guide Hut at Well Brae as a playroom.

Klein published a paper in 1945 which includes extracts from the analysis with “Richard”, ‘The Oedipus Complex in the Light of Early Anxieties’ and describes in that paper the link between the depressive position and the Oedipus complex (Klein, 1945 [1975]).

It was not until the final years of her life that Klein fully wrote up the analytic work with “Richard” in the *Narrative of a Child Analysis: The Conduct of the Psycho-Analysis of Children as Seen in the Treatment of a Ten-Year-Old Boy*, published posthumously in 1961 (Klein, 1961). The book details the progress of the analysis session by session, with Klein’s notes and the 74 pictures drawn by Richard during the analysis. It is the remarkable nature of this book, to which Klein put the finishing touches from her hospital bed just before her death in 1960, that draws us to Pitlochry to celebrate Klein’s achievement.

The *Narrative* gives detailed notes of the 93 sessions held daily Mondays to Saturdays over four months with “Richard”. The reader is told of a hotel where “Richard” and his mother stayed up until session 65. This hotel was the Fisher’s Hotel in the main street of Pitlochry. From session 66, because his father was ill (Klein, 1961 p.379), “Richard” moved in with a family who Klein calls the “Wilson” family. The older boy “John Wilson” was also in analysis with Mrs. Klein. “John Wilson” talked to “Richard” about Mrs. Klein, and this appeared in Richard’s material. “John Wilson” must have been “Richard’s” 16-year-old cousin, who also appears in “Richard’s” first drawing as the submarine U16. A family connection between “Richard” and “John Wilson” is



not mentioned by either Hanna Segal nor Donald Meltzer, both of whom wrote about the *Narrative* in the 1970's (Segal, 1979; Meltzer, 1978).

“Richard” walked daily up the hill from Fisher’s Hotel and normally waited on the corner of the road or immediately outside the Hut. Not everything went smoothly with the practical arrangements. At the beginning of “Richard’s” ninth session, Klein tells us, “Unexpectedly Mrs. K. had been unable to get the key on her way, and she and Richard went back to fetch it. Richard was obviously disturbed and worried about this, though he did not say so. He commented, however, on the noise the crows were making, remarking that they ‘sounded frightened’.”

On the 20th session the playroom was not available. No explanation is given, just that “Mrs. K. met Richard outside and took him to the house where she was living.” Klein adds, “Richard was very thrilled to see Mrs. K.’s lodgings at last, all the more as he knew that he was one of the few patients whom she did not treat there.”

For the 38th session, the penultimate session before a nine-day break whilst Klein returned to London, the note is as follows: “Mrs. K. could not open the door of the playroom because something had gone wrong with the lock. She therefore took Richard to her lodgings. Richard was sad about this on this occasion. On the way he suggested that if John was due to come soon after him, he would leave as soon as Mrs. K. asked him to, because he did not want to take up John’s time.”

There are five sessions interspersed between sessions 52, and 69, in which “Richard” met Mrs. K. near her lodgings. Session 52 is the occasion when “Richard” met Mrs. K. near her lodgings with the piece of salmon. Klein writes that Richard seemed proud and identified with his father’s skill in catching the salmon. Klein charmingly adds a footnote that Richard’s father had obtained a



licence for salmon-fishing, as if the reader might suspect otherwise. In this small community, Klein, her patients and their families all knew one another and it was impossible for Mrs. K. to be entirely within the playroom with “Richard”.

Despite the pleasant surroundings of Pitlochry Klein knew from the outset with “Richard” that she would return to London, which she did after four months in the late summer of 1941. Back in London she resumed her practice there and organised the defence of her position in the battles within the British Psychoanalytic Society (Grosskurth, 1986; King and Steiner, 1991).

The *Narrative of a Child Analysis* gives us a unique insight into Klein’s method of working. It is also of interest because the analysis took place before her 1946 paper ‘Notes on some Schizoid Mechanisms’ in which Klein in a sense once again changed everything. It was only after the publication of ‘Envy and Gratitude’, in 1957 (Klein, 1957), that Klein began work on writing up her process notes to produce the *Narrative of a Child Analysis*. Klein’s commentary encapsulates her mature views as well as her earlier technique back in 1941. Most of all the *Narrative* of Klein’s work with “Richard” hands down to us a vivid account of the emotional life of a ten-year-old; the passions, anxieties, joys, triumph, sadistic impulses, concern, and interest in the world that we live in. Paying careful attention to both the internal and external setting of the analysis, Klein brilliantly exposes, in the playroom and in the transference, how “Richard” experienced that special paradox of the human mind: a phantasy world of concretely expressed object relations.



Klein in Scotland II

In the first of these two brief historical essays yesterday I focused mainly on how Melanie Klein came to be in Scotland in 1940 and 1941, and the significant work she did whilst here in Pitlochry with her ten-year-old patient “Richard” in the Guide Hut which she used as a playroom. I recalled how on Saturday 2nd May 1987, a group of us gathered in the road on Well Brae, to watch Hanna Segal unveil a commemorative plaque at the Girl Guide Hut.

The circumstances of the unveiling ceremony 30 years ago, of historical interest in themselves to students of Klein, also illustrate how Klein’s work as a whole has continued to be recognised in Scotland, and studied and applied in clinical work. I want to say that in my experience no-one did more over the years to teach and promote the clinical value of Klein than Dr. Paul O’Farrell, now retired in ill health in Edinburgh. Hanna Segal in her speech for the unveiling ceremony in 1987 especially thanked Dr. O’Farrell who was, in her words, “the moving spirit of the whole venture”.

From the 1970’s for around three decades twice a year, in spring and autumn, Pitlochry conferences were held at Scotland’s Hotel at the bottom of the hill leading up to the Guide Hut, just a short walk also from Ashbank House in Tomcroy Road where Klein had lodged, and saw older patients in one of the rooms in the house. The unveiling of the plaque was held at the end of the May 1987 Pitlochry conference.

At the ceremony Hanna Segal represented both the Melanie Klein Trust and the British Psychoanalytical Society. Girl Guides lined up outside their hut, and there was a presentation to the Guides Commissioner, Mrs. Patricia David, of framed photographs of small toys used by Klein, some of Richard’s drawings and some explanatory notes. The gathering was addressed by Perth and Kinross District Councillor Hugh Campbell J.P., Hanna Segal and Paul



Melanie Klein Trust

O'Farrell who was at that time Chairman of the Scottish Association of Psychoanalytic Psychotherapists. Sandra Grant, was present as Chair of the Psychotherapy Section of the Scottish Division of the Royal College of Psychiatrists, and George Crawford represented the Association of Child Psychotherapists.

“Richard”, Klein’s patient from the Guide Hut in 1941, came to the unveiling in 1987. Phyllis Grosskurth had published her biography of Klein a year before in 1986 (Grosskurth, 1986). Grosskurth describes meeting with the now adult “Richard”. Apparently he was unaware that his analysis had been the subject of a book until Grosskurth told him and gave him a copy of the *Narrative* to read (Klein, 1961). My recollection is that Richard’s presence at the unveiling in Pitlochry was low key, and that he wished to watch discretely from the back of the assembled gathering.

In contrast Eric Clyne, Melanie Klein’s son, joined in with proceedings and later wrote to Paul O’Farrell, on his return home to Potters Bar, “I would like to thank you for inviting me to the plaque unveiling. I not only enjoyed myself, but found the warm simplicity of the speeches rather moving. I am also pleased that it was obviously meaningful for the guides and local residents.” (O’Farrell, 2017). Not long afterwards we heard that Eric Clyne had died suddenly on 11th June 1987 in Norway.

Yesterday I described the five patients Klein had in Pitlochry: “Dick” had been in analysis with Klein in London, described as a four-year-old 12 years earlier in Klein’s paper ‘Symbol-Formation in Ego Development’ (Klein, 1930). “Dick” and his family seeking a safe haven during the war had moved to Pitlochry and persuaded Klein to join them in July 1940. Klein worked with “Dick”, now 16 years old, and also Dick’s brother, according to Grosskurth (1986 p. 259). “Richard” who was their cousin, came to Pitlochry to start his analysis in late April 1941 (Grosskurth, 1986 p. 266). I suggested that the boy who appears in



Richard's analysis and in drawings as the submarine U16, named as "John Wilson" by Klein in the *Narrative*, is almost certainly her patient "Dick", Richard's cousin.

Klein also saw two adult patients at Ashbank House, a general practitioner, Dr. Jack Fieldman who had been referred by Sylvia Payne, and her psychoanalytic colleague from the British Society, Dr. David Matthew, who had also referred "Richard" to Klein (Grosskurth, 1986 p. 259). Dr Matthew according to Segal was disabled by multiple sclerosis (Hunter, 1993). He remained in Scotland during the war years, working in Edinburgh in 1942, then moving for a while to Rosemount, a village just outside Blairgowrie not far from Pitlochry by 1944, before returning to London in 1946 (information taken from International Psychoanalytic Association membership lists for those years).

Paula Heimann was in analysis with Klein prior to Klein's move to Pitlochry. Heimann's daughter, Mrs Mirza Peatie, told Phyllis Grosskurth that she remembered spending a holiday with her mother in Pitlochry which was probably in the summer of 1940 (Grosskurth, 1986 p. 383). It was unlikely that Heimann was in Pitlochry for long because she was classified as an alien at that time, therefore not permitted to travel freely, unlike Klein who had acquired British citizenship in 1934 (English Heritage, 2017).

Paula Heimann makes another Scottish connection. Paula Heimann had been born in Danzig of Russian Jewish parents in 1899 and died in London in 1982. She studied medicine and psychiatry in Germany. She trained in psychoanalysis in Berlin where her analyst was Theodor Reik, and was an Associate Member of the Berlin Psycho-Analytical Society. When Hitler came to power in 1933 Ernest Jones wrote to Max Eitingon in Berlin issuing an invitation to any psychoanalysts who felt threatened to come to London. In Berlin Paula Heimann was arrested and questioned in connection with the



Reichstag fire. After her release she left Berlin for London arriving in July 1933. Heimann was elected to Associate Membership of the British Psychoanalytical Society later in 1933 (King, 1989). When Melanie Klein's elder son Hans was killed in a climbing accident in the Tatra Mountains in April 1934 (Grosskurth, 1986 p.214), Klein turned to Heimann, apparently relieved to have a supportive native German speaker to turn to in her grief.

Ernest Jones pressed Heimann to obtain a British medical qualification. With much difficulty, Ernest Jones and Edward Glover had negotiated with the British Medical Association for the recognition of psychoanalysis as a professional discipline, which they achieved in 1929. Scotsman Edward Glover had had a distinguished medical and research career in chest medicine at Glasgow University and elsewhere before going with his brother James to Berlin to train in psychoanalysis with Abraham (Kubie, 1973). It was important for the British Psychoanalytical Society to have sufficient medical members. As a result Paula Heimann came to Edinburgh. My assumption is that Heimann got her British medical qualification through the Extramural School of Medicine in Edinburgh and the Triple Qualification awarded at that time by the three Scottish Royal Colleges, which was recognised by the General Medical Council. Extramural medical teaching in Edinburgh played an historic role in the emancipation of women in the 19th century, but then became a magnet for displaced overseas doctors like Paula Heimann who could study in Edinburgh and qualify to register with the British General Medical Council.

Many European students came escaping from the rise of fascism in their home countries and were supported by John Orr who was Dean of the school from 1924 until 1948, in the teeth of considerable opposition from the British Home Office, from some factions in the British Medical Association, and other international medical bodies. The atmosphere of persecution of those times was captured in 1938, the year that Paula Heimann passed the Edinburgh



qualification, by one American student who wrote to John Orr, “I have just received notice from the New York State Education Department that (..... in conjunction with the American Medical Association) they will no longer recognise your school as proper preparation for New York candidates...it seems that you were too tolerant of Jews and allowed them to study in your school when this democratic country wanted them limited in numbers” (The Royal College of Surgeons Archive, 2017).

Another Edinburgh medical graduate, Dr. Millicent Dewar, a Scottish member of the British Psychoanalytical Society who was mostly based in London, came back to Edinburgh in 1979 and joined the training committee of the Scottish Institute of Human Relations before returning to London in 1986. Millicent Dewar had been analysed by Paula Heimann, whilst Heimann was still one of Klein’s closest colleagues and supporters (Dewar, 1986). During the war years Millicent Dewar had participated in the Northfield Experiments at Northfield Military Hospital in Birmingham (Harrison, 2000). Relations between Paula Heimann and Klein cooled after Heimann read her paper ‘On Counter-Transference’ in 1949 (Heimann, 1950), and then broke down entirely when Heimann disagreed with Klein’s formulation of innate envy in ‘Envy and Gratitude’ (Klein, 1957 [1975]). As a result in 1955 Heimann announced that she was no longer to be regarded as a Kleinian (King, 1989). Millicent Dewar also departed with her. Nevertheless, during her time in Edinburgh in her practice and teaching until 1986, Millicent Dewar had also helped to maintain the place of Kleinian thought at the Scottish Institute of Human Relations.

Scottish psychoanalyst, Dr. Simon Lindsay, who died in 2005, worked as a child psychiatrist in the Child and Family Psychiatry Department at Stratheden Hospital in Fife from the early 1960’s until his retirement in 1983. He was analysed by Klein (O’Farrell, 2017), and used to describe himself as the only “direct Kleinian” in Scotland (Morton, 2009). Whilst training as a



psychoanalyst in London in 1949 he took a post as psychiatrist at what was then known as St Lawrence's Hospital for Mental Defectives, which was in Caterham in Surrey. Whilst there he was supervised by the Canadian Clifford Scott, who had the distinction of being Klein's first training analysand. Scott encouraged Simon Lindsay to undertake psychoanalysis with his intellectually disabled patients. Later Simon Lindsay continued this work at the Tavistock clinic working with John Bowlby and Donald Winnicott (O'Driscoll, 2009). Simon Lindsay was for a time a member of the training committee of the Scottish Institute of Human Relations (O'Farrell, 2017).

Let me return to Hanna Segal and another aspect of how her visit to Pitlochry 30 years ago in 1987 was symbolic of the way in which the legacy of Klein's work has been intertwined with psychoanalysis in Scotland.

Hannah Segal's undergraduate medical studies in Poland were interrupted in 1939. Caught in Paris at the outbreak of war, she crossed to London. Applying to continue her medical degree in 1940 at the Royal Free Hospital she discovered that she would have to start from the beginning again. In Edinburgh her previous undergraduate studies in Warsaw were recognised, and she was able to graduate in 1943. This was because there was a Polish Faculty of Medicine at Edinburgh University from 1941 to 1949 (PSMUE, 2017).

Lt. Col Professor Francis Crew, who had enlisted to run the military hospital at Edinburgh Castle, noticed the number of Polish doctors and medical students in refugee camps. He proposed a Polish Medical Faculty to train much-needed medical personnel. The Faculty, supported by the Polish government in exile, was integrated as part of Edinburgh University. Just under 250 doctors had graduated from the Polish Faculty by the time it closed after the war. One of these was Hanna Segal.



Whilst in Edinburgh between 1941 and 1943 Hanna Segal consulted Ronald Fairbairn about her wish to train as a psychoanalyst. Fairbairn advised her that there were disagreements going on in London and she should decide which side she wanted to be on. He lent her two books, Melanie Klein's *The Psycho-Analysis of Children* (Klein, 1932 [1975]) and Anna Freud's *The Ego and the Mechanisms of Defense* (Freud, A., 1936 [1966]). Returning the books Hannah Segal informed Fairbairn that she wished to train with Melanie Klein. Fairbairn then sent her to David Matthew, who was at that time in Edinburgh. Hanna Segal had a year of analysis with David Matthew before going back to London. In London she went into analysis with Klein (Hunter, 1993). 44 years later she came back to Scotland to unveil the plaque at the Guide Hut.

At that time in 1987, there had been lengthy discussion between British Psychoanalytical Society members in London and their colleagues teaching in Scotland, about the problem of training in psychoanalysis in Britain outside London. When in Pitlochry, Hanna Segal expressed a fairly unequivocal view that there would be no recognition of the Scottish Institute of Human Relations training by the British Psychoanalytical Society, nor any modification of the existing training programme in London for training at a distance from London, such as in Scotland.

Perhaps Hanna Segal was letting us know about a shadow of anxiety cast from that time when Klein was fighting for survival within psychoanalysis and the British Society, both before and after her period of respite in Pitlochry in 1940 and 1941. There are challenging realities about training upon which the integrity of any profession rests, psychoanalysis more than most perhaps, but in fact Hanna Segal was unduly pessimistic. The British Psychoanalytic Society has continued since the late 1980's to expand the reach of its training programmes, first with the Sponsored Training Scheme which ran throughout the 1990's and trained a group who are generally regarded as serious-minded



Melanie Klein Trust

psychoanalysts from Scotland, the North East of England and Northern Ireland. That work led to the Northern training in psychoanalysis which is based in Leeds. There is also now the New Entry Scheme for BPC (British Psychoanalytic Council) registered psychoanalytic psychotherapists from any part of the UK who meet the entry criteria and are committed to intensive psychoanalytic work. Special arrangements have also been put in place with the Northern Ireland Association for the Study of Psychoanalysis.

It is a strange irony that Hanna Segal who felt such developments were unlikely, by travelling here to Pitlochry in 1987, and giving of herself and her wisdom in a spirit of great generosity, made her own perhaps unwitting contribution to a trend that did in fact produce another generation of psychoanalysts in Scotland, all of whom were influenced by Klein's object relations theory. This in turn has strengthened the Scottish training programmes for both adult Psychoanalytic Psychotherapists, and for Child Psychotherapists, that continue to the present day and continue to teach Klein's work.

REFERENCES

MK, 1975 : refers to *The Writings of Melanie Klein Vols. I - IV*, (1975) Ed. Money-Kyrle, R.E. London: Hogarth

MKT, 2017 : the Melanie Klein Trust website in 2017:
<http://www.melanie-klein-trust.org.uk/home>

SE I - XXIV : refers to *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud*. Ed. James Strachey 24 vols. (1953-1964) London: Hogarth



Melanie Klein Trust

Abraham, K. (1924 [1927]) *A Short Study of the Development of the Libido, Viewed in the Light of Mental Disorders*; in *Selected Papers of Karl Abraham, M.D.* Eds. Bryan, D. & Strachey, (1927) A. London: Hogarth.

Dewar, M. (1986) Personal Communication.

English Heritage (2017)

<http://www.english-heritage.org.uk/visit/blue-plaques/klein-melanie-1882-1960>

Fairbairn, W.R.D. (1944 [1952]) *Endopsychic Structure Considered in Terms of Object-Relationships*. In *Psychoanalytic Studies of the Personality*. (1952) London: Routledge & Kegan Paul

Fairbairn, W.R.D. (1946 [1952]) *Object-Relationships and Dynamic Structure*. In *Psychoanalytic Studies of the Personality*. (1952) London: Routledge & Kegan Paul

Ferenczi, S. (1909 [1952]) 'Introjection and Transference', pp. 35-93 in *First Contributions to Psycho-Analysis* Ed. Jones E. (1952) London: Hogarth

Ferenczi, S. (1912 [1955]) 'On the Definition of Introjection', pp. 316-318 in *Final Contributions to the Problems and methods of Psycho-Analysis* Ed. Balint M. (1955) London: Hogarth

Freud, A. (1936 [1966]) *The Ego and the Mechanisms of Defense*. London: Hogarth; New York: International Universities Press (1966)

Freud, S. (1917 [1915]) *Mourning and Melancholia* **SE XIV** pp. 237-258

Freud, S. (1923) *The Ego and the Id* **SE XIX** pp. 1-66



Melanie Klein Trust

Glover, E. (1933) Review: *The Psychoanalysis of Children*: By Melanie Klein. Authorised translation by Alix Strachey *Int. J. Psycho-Anal.* **14** : 119-129.

Glover, E. (1948 [1956]) *The Future Development of Psycho-Analysis*; in *On the Early Development of the Mind* (1956) London: Imago pp. 333-351

Grosskurth, P. (1986) *Melanie Klein: Her World and Her Work* London: Hodder & Stoughton

Harrison, T. (2000) *Bion, Rickman, Foulkes and the Northfield Experiments: Advancing on a Different Front* London: Jessica Kingsley

Heimann, P. (1950) *On Countertransference* *Int. J. Psycho-Anal.* **31**: pp. 81-84; also in *About Children and Children No-Longer: Collected Papers 1942-80: Paula Heimann* (1989) Ed. Margret Tonnesmann London: Routledge

Hunter, V. (1993) 'An Interview with Hanna Segal' *Psychoanalytic Review* **80** 1-28

King, P. (1989) 'Paula Heimann's Quest for Her Own Identity as a Psychoanalyst: an Introductory Memoir'; in *About Children and Children No-Longer: Collected Papers 1942-80: Paula Heimann* Ed. Margret Tonnesmann (1989) London: Routledge

King, P. & Steiner, R. (1991) *The Freud-Klein Controversies 1941-1945* London: Tavistock/Routledge

Klein, M. (1930 [1975]) 'The Importance of Symbol-Formation in the Development of the Ego'. In **MK I**, (1975) pp. 219-232. London:Hogarth.



Melanie Klein Trust

Klein, M. (1932 [1975]) *The Psycho-Analysis of Children* London: Hogarth,
and **MK II** London: Hogarth

Klein M. (1935 [1975]) 'A Contribution to the Psychogenesis of Manic-
Depressive States', in **MK I** (1975) pp. 262-289 London: Hogarth

Klein, M. (1940 [1975]) 'Mourning and its Relation to Manic-Depressive
States', in **MK I** (1975) pp. 344-369 London: Hogarth

Klein, M. (1945 [1975]) 'The Oedipus Complex in the Light of Early Anxieties',
in **MK I** (1975) pp. 344-369 London: Hogarth

Klein, M. (1946 [1975]) 'Notes on Some Schizoid Mechanisms' in **MK III**
(1975) pp. 1-24 London: Hogarth

Klein, M. (1957 [1975]) *Envy and Gratitude* (1957) London: Hogarth also in
MK III (1975) pp. 176-235 London: Hogarth

Klein, M. (1961 [1975]) *The Narrative of a Child Analysis* London: Hogarth,
and **MK IV**, (1975) London: Hogarth.

Kubie, L.S. (1973) Edward Glover: A Biographical Sketch *Int. J. Psycho-Anal.*
54: pp. 85-95

Lindon, J.A. (1966) 'Melanie Klein 1882-1960: Her View of the Unconscious'.
In *Psychoanalytic Pioneers* Eds. Alexander, F., Eisenstein, S. & Grotjahn, M.
(1966) New York: Basic Books

Meltzer, D. (1978) *The Kleinian Development Part II: Richard Week-by-Week*
Perthshire: Clunie



Melanie Klein Trust

Messed, P. & Kendrick, W. (1986) *The Letters of James and Alix Strachey 1924-1925* London: Chatto & Windus

Morton, H. (2009) quoted in *The Development of Child and Adolescent Psychiatry from 1960 until 1990: Witness Seminar, Centre for the History of Medicine, Glasgow University* Eds. Graham, P.; Minnis, H.; and Nicolson, M. (2009) https://www.gla.ac.uk/media/media_196525_en.pdf

O'Driscoll, D. (2009) 'Psychotherapy and Intellectual Disability: a Historical View.' In *Intellectual Disability, Trauma and Psychotherapy* Ed. Cottis, T. (2009) London: Routledge

O'Farrell, P. (2017) Personal Communication.

PSMUE (2017): Polish School of Medicine on University of Edinburgh website: http://ourhistory.is.ed.ac.uk/index.php/Polish_School_of_Medicine

The Royal College of Surgeons Archive, 13th February 2017
<https://library.rcsed.ac.uk/about-us/blog/archive/i-am-a-refugee-of-nazi-oppression-the-scottish-royal-medical-colleges-and-medical-refugees>

Sayers, J. (1991) *Mothering Psychoanalysis* Hamish Hamilton: London

Segal, H. (1979) *Klein* London: Fontana